Argumentation: Developing an Argument
Modified from http://writing.colostate.edu/guides/reading/toulmin/

Toulmin Method—based on work of philosopher Stephen Toulmin
Effective way of getting to the how and why levels of arguments

Claim—Evidence—Anticipated Objections/Rebuttal—Draw Conclusions

The Claim—the most general statement in argumentation (the thesis)
- Recognize Qualifiers and Exceptions—used by writer to limit claim
- Identify Qualifiers—terms that make a claim more flexible (words like some, most, many, in general, usually, typically, almost, frequently, often, in most cases, likely, maybe, might, often, probably, sometimes, usually, if...then...).
- Identify Exceptions (situations where claim doesn’t apply)

The Reasons—First line of development in argumentation
- Determine Relevance and Effectiveness of Reasons
- Relevance—Are they relevant to the claim?
- Effectiveness—Does this invoke a value judgment? Be careful with subjectiveness.

The Evidence—Must be sufficient, credible, and accurate
- Sufficient—Is there enough evidence to support the reasons and claim?
- Credible—Is the evidence from believable and authoritative sources? Does it match the writer’s experience or is it from a more knowledgeable or authoritative source?
- Accuracy—Are the statistics verifiable from credible sources? Are quotations complete and used in context? Are facts verifiable from multiple sources?

Anticipated Objections & Rebuttal—Must be sufficient, credible, and accurate
- Objections—Refute or rebut objections using evidence
- Counter-arguments—Identify and use evidence to support your rebuttal of counter-arguments

Drawing Conclusions—Overall, coherent statement about effectiveness of the claim
A Toulmin Model Outline for Analyzing Arguments
(modified from Timothy W. Crusius and Carolyn E. Channell, The Aims of Argument, p. 34)

Claim:
Qualifier?
Exceptions:

**Reason 1**
What makes this reason relevant?
What makes this reason effective?
What evidence supports this reason?
Is this evidence sufficient?
Is this evidence credible?
Is this evidence accurate?
Source:
Objection:
Rebuttal:

**Reason 2**
What makes this reason relevant?
What makes this reason effective?
What evidence supports this reason?
Is this evidence sufficient?
Is this evidence credible?
Is this evidence accurate?
Source:
Objection:
Rebuttal:

**Reason 3**
What makes this reason relevant?
What makes this reason effective?
What evidence supports this reason?
Is this evidence sufficient?
Is this evidence credible?
Is this evidence accurate?
Source:
Objection:
Rebuttal:

Source: 2011 Utah ELA Core Academy