

---

## JUDGMENT SITUATIONS

**Situation 1:** In Victor Hugo's novel, Les Miserables, the main character, Jean Valjean, is an escaped convict living under an assumed name. (He was sent to prison for life because he stole a 10-cent loaf of bread to feed his sister's starving children.) He has built up a successful business in which he employs most of his fellow townspeople. He becomes the mayor and a public benefactor. Then Jean Valjean learns that another man, a feeble-minded old beggar, has been mistakenly identified as the escaped convict (himself), and has been arrested. The beggar will certainly be sent to prison to serve the life sentence originally given to Jean Valjean. Should he leave all he has worked to obtain, and put all his workers out of a job?...or...should he let an innocent man spend his entire life in prison for something he did not do?

**Situation 2:** In Tennessee William's play, Suddenly Last Summer, a wealthy widow promises a large amount of money to build and support a much needed hospital on the condition that a certain female patient, who is quite sane, be committed as insane and have a lobotomy performed on her so that she will never make any trouble by revealing facts embarrassing to the wealthy widow. One life would be ruined, but many others would be saved with the new hospital. Should the money for the hospital be accepted on the widow's condition?...or... should the donation not be accepted?

**Situation 3:** In Sinclair Lewis' novel, Arrowsmith, Dr. Arrowsmith has perfected a new vaccine which, if used, will end an outbreak of the plague in the West Indies. If he uses the vaccine on everyone, most or all of the people will be cured. But his vaccine will not be accepted by the medical and scientific communities unless he divides the infected tribe in half, giving the vaccine to only one half and nothing to the other half. If he gives vaccine only to some, thousands of other people will needlessly die. Doesn't he have to do this in order to prove to the medical and scientific communities that it was the vaccine which saved the infected people's lives? Should Dr. Arrowsmith agree to dividing the tribe in half and saving one half?...or... Should Dr. Arrowsmith make his vaccine unavailable until everyone can have access to it?

**Situation 4:** In the novel, The Client, by John Grisham, an 11-year-old boy knows some information that the FBI needs to convict a mafia killer. In the process of gaining this information, his younger brother goes into a trauma-caused semi-comatose state and needs special 24-hour medical attention. If he tells the FBI the information they need, the mafia has threatened to kill his family. If he doesn't tell the FBI, they will put him in a youth lock-up facility. Should the boy tell?...or...should he not tell?